

**PATENTS AND MEDICAL
BIOTECHNOLOGY: AN
EMPIRICAL ANALYSIS OF
ISSUES FACING THE
AUSTRALIAN INDUSTRY**

**DIANNE NICOL AND JANE
NIELSEN**

**CENTRE FOR LAW AND
GENETICS
OCCASIONAL PAPER No. 6**

All rights reserved

Copyright ©2003 University of Tasmania, Dianne Nicol and Jane Nielsen

Apart from fair dealing for the purposes of study, research, criticism or review, as permitted under copyright law, no part of this publication shall be reproduced by any process without written permission of the owners of copyright. Inquiries should be made to the authors or publisher.

National Library of Australia Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

ISSN 1445-2766

This issue may be cited as:

Centre for Law and Genetics Occasional Paper No. 6 (2003).

Published by
Centre for Law and Genetics
Faculty of Law
University of Tasmania
Private Bag 89
Hobart Tasmania 7001
Australia

Printed by
UniPrint
University of Tasmania
Private Bag 15
Hobart Tasmania 7001
Australia

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	viii
Abstract	x

PART 1: CONTEXTUALISING THE ISSUES

Context Chapter 1: Aims of this Study	3
Context Chapter 2: Background	6
The Role of Patents in the Australian Medical Biotechnology Industry	6
Medical Biotechnology Research in Australia	12
Other Empirical Studies	16
Context Chapter 3: Patenting of Biotechnology	
Inventions in Australia	20
Patentability Requirements	20
Use Of Patents	34
Patent Activity in Australia	38
Context Chapter 4: Impact of Patents on Medical Biotechnology	
Research and Development	50
Patents and Public Sector Research	50
Restrictions on Access to Upstream Patents	53
The Tragedy of the Anticommons	56

The Consumer Perspective – Restrictions on Access to Biotechnology-Related Products	57
Context Chapter 5: Study Methods	64
Surveys	64
Interviews	67

PART 2: RESULTS OF THE EMPIRICAL STUDY

Results Chapter 1: Research And Patent Issues	75
Patent Activity	76
Views On Patents	81
Results Chapter 2: Transfer of Technology	93
Survey Data on Collaborative Activity	94
Survey Data on Licensing-out Activity	100
Licensing, Assignment and Mergers	103
Technology Transfer Issues for Research Institutions	105
Technology Transfer from Upstream to Downstream	
Industry Sectors	110
Licensing-in	114
Licence Terms	115
Summary	122
Results Chapter 3: Impact of Patents on the Research Sector	124
Changing Attitudes towards Commercialisation of	

Biotechnology Research	125
Effect of Patents on Publication	126
Quantum and Quality Issues	130
Ownership and Clean Title	132
Under- and Over-Valuing	134
Summary	136
Results Chapter 4: Restrictions on Access to Upstream	
Patents	137
Blocking Patents	140
Refusals to Licence	145
Exclusivity	150
Costs and Delays Associated with Licensing Patents	156
Restrictive Terms	160
Failure to Exploit Patents	168
Summary	172
Results Chapter 5: Anticommons Issues	174
Preconditions to an Anticommons in Australia	176
Patent Searching Obligations	178
Survey Data on Number of In-Licences	184
Number of In-licences and Project Abandonment	186
Royalty Stacking	191
Reach-through Right Stacking	193
Summary	194

Results Chapter 6: Supply to End Users	196
Pharmaceuticals	196
Devices	198
Diagnostics	198
Summary	205
Results Chapter 7: Market Solutions	208
Collaborations and Licensing	208
Inventing Around	211
Patent Enforcement	214
Research Exemption	218
Challenges to Validity	222
Summary	224

**PART 3: OUTCOMES OF THIS STUDY: THE WAY
FORWARD**

Outcomes Chapter 1: The Legal Landscape And Options	
For Reform	229
Excluding Gene Sequences	231
Excluding Diagnostic Tests	233
Public Interest Provision	233
Increasing The Stringency Of Patent Invention and	
Disclosure Requirements	234
Exemptions From Infringement	236

Compulsory Licensing / Government Use Provisions	236
Fair Use And Automatic/ Statutory Licensing	239
Collective Rights Organisations	242
The Role Of Competition Law	244
Summary	248
Outcomes Chapter 2: Conclusions	250
Study Findings	250
Reform Options	258
Bibliography	261

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1:	Patents linked to cessation of tests in the US and equivalent Australian patents	62
Table 2:	Interview respondents	68
Table 3:	Numbers of patents held	78
Table 4:	Types of patents held	79
Table 5:	General views on the impact of patents on research	83
Table 6:	Views on the impact of types of patents on research	83
Table 7:	Collaborative activity: research institution survey respondents	95
Table 8:	Types of collaborators and their geographical location: research institution survey respondents	95
Table 9:	Types of collaborators: company survey respondents	96
Table 10:	Types of collaborators: diagnostic facility survey results	97
Table 11:	Number and types of out-licences: research institution and company results	100
Table 12:	Company and research institution respondents with patents but with no out-licences	101
Table 13:	Views on the impact of patents on publication in the research institution and diagnostics sectors	127
Table 14:	Numbers and types of in-licences	184

Table 15: Location of laboratory	199
Table 16: Types of tests	200
Table 17: Cost of tests	200
Table 18: Payment of licence fees or royalties	201
Table 19: Notifications	201
Table 20: Views on the impact of patents on diagnostic tests	202